



Joint Submission to the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on the occasion of the consideration of list of issues for Turkmenistan at the 77th Session, February 2025

Submitted by

Progres Foundation and Access Now

28 November 2024

Information on Submitters

Progres Foundation¹ ("Progres" with one "s" as in the Turkmen language) is a non-profit organization based in the United States that supports various progressive initiatives that contribute to understanding of social realities, shaping a new vision and approaches to sustainable human development in Turkmenistan. There are two flagship informational portals established by Progres Foundation: <u>Saglyk.org</u> and <u>Progres.online</u>. Saglyk.org has been working to improve public health literacy in Turkmenistan over the last 15 years. Progres.online is an online analytical journal that promotes nuanced understanding of societal trends.

Access Now² is an international organization that works to defend and extend the digital rights of individuals and communities at risk around the world. Through representation worldwide, Access Now provides thought leadership and policy recommendations to the public and private sectors to ensure the continued openness of the internet and the protection of fundamental rights. By combining direct technical support, comprehensive policy engagement, global advocacy, grassroots grantmaking, legal interventions, and convenings such as RightsCon, it fights for human rights in the digital age. As an ECOSOC accredited organization, Access Now routinely engages with the United Nations (UN) in support of our mission to extend and defend human rights in the digital age.

¹ Progres Foundation, available at: <u>https://progres.online/</u>, accessed 20 November 2024

² Access Now, available at: <u>https://www.accessnow.org/</u>, accessed 13 November 2024

- 1. This report supplements the third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan (state party) under articles 16 and 17 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Covenant) in connection with the upcoming review of the state party's compliance with the Covenant. The undersigned organizations welcome the opportunity to contribute to the work of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Committee) by providing additional information regarding access to the Internet under article 15 of the Covenant. The report describes Turkmenistan's practices that raise particular concerns about: (1) internet shutdowns and their impact on right to education (article 13), right to healthy life (article 12), right to culture and to benefit from scientific progress (article 15), right to pursue economic development (article 1 and article 2); and (2) Internet connectivity and aggressive online censorship imposed by the Government, including government's plan to build the National Digital Network that is splintered and isolated from the rest of the Internet.
- 2. Past recommendations from the Committee: In 2011 (para 29) and in 2018 (para 44 and 45) the Committee was concerned by "the limited access to the Internet in the State party, particularly in rural areas in which the Internet is either unavailable or very slow (art. 15)." The Committee recommended the State party to extend assistance to the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups so as to enable them to have access to the Internet and to other scientific and technological advances, in order to enhance their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.
- 3. State party's response to the Committee's questions: In its initial reporting (2011) the State party stated that (Para 26) "all schools had modern computer and media equipment, with access to the Internet," and (Para 29) "all Turkmen citizens had access to the Internet, either at home, via Internet-enabled mobile phones through cellular networks, in educational establishments, or in Internet cafes available in public places." However, later State party's reports revealed that, <u>as of 4 June 2018</u> "over 2.5 million subscribers were using the Internet over mobile and fixed networks" (Para 193) and <u>as of 13 October 2023</u> there were "more than 3 million Internet users in Turkmenistan" (Para 190). This data indicates that not all citizens of Turkmenistan have access to the Internet but at best <u>half of the country's population</u>. Likewise, according to the <u>Voluntary National Review</u> of Turkmenistan (2023) only 37.2% of schools have internet access for educational purposes, with 64.4% coverage in urban areas and only 23.3% in rural schools.
- 4. State party's response to the Committee's recommendations: According to the State party (Para 193), "over the past 5 years, over 15 private websites and portals have been set up and are in operation," and (Para 194) "in Turkmenistan, there are no restrictions on the use of Internet sites, except those prohibited by law, inter alia to propagate terrorist and radical intentions." Such a low number of independent websites created by the residents of

Turkmenistan indicates persisting challenges with open and unrestricted access to the Internet. Progres Foundation has published a number of articles <u>contextualizing the Internet</u> <u>blockade</u>, providing a <u>detailed analysis of Internet censorship and circumvention</u>, the <u>regulation of the Internet</u> and annual reports on <u>the state of Internet</u> in Turkmenistan. According to this research, the Government continues to block websites irrespective of their content using carpet blockings where IP addresses are blocked by entire subnets. <u>The blocked sites</u> range from educational resources, social media platforms, foreign news outlets, online games, video communication platforms, to online shopping websites and online payment platforms. Most of these restrictions are arbitrary, not subject to independent judicial review, and are imposed without warnings or explanations to the website owners. The government does not make a list of banned websites public, while owners of these blocked resources have no way to challenge the government decision and seek redress.³

- 5. According to the State party's <u>third periodic report</u> (para 191), the number of Internet banking customers reached 900,000 users as of January 1, 2023. According to the <u>Central Bank of Turkmenistan</u>, as of 1 April 2024 there were 1,076,679 users of internet banking, 72,176 users of mobile banking and there were 767 e-commerce transactions. Out of this, the capital city Ashgabat accounts for 21.6%, 20.4% and 63.1%, respectively. These numbers confirm limited access to the Internet among the population as well as the digital and financial divide between the capital city and the rest of the country. Progres Foundation's <u>research</u> shows that the population of Turkmenistan is sealed off from international financial services and can not engage in international banking transactions. The registered bank users can only use "sovereign Internet" services provided by Turkmen banks to conduct domestic transactions.
- 6. State party's <u>report</u> (para 192, 193, 194) mentions various national programs aimed at transitioning to the digital economy including creation of a unified portal for public services. According to the <u>GovTech Maturity Index</u>, Turkmenistan has the least developed digitalization of government services in Europe and Central Asia. The use of innovative digital solutions in providing public services is very limited in Turkmenistan. In 2022, Turkmenistan ranked 137th on the <u>E-Government Development Index</u>, and 180th on the E-Participation Index among 193 countries. Meanwhile, the National concept for development of the digital economy in Turkmenistan for 2019-2025 is not publicly available, and the official <u>website</u> for public services is inaccessible.

³ Progres Foundation, *The State Directed Internet Blockade Continued in Turkmenistan in 2023*, Progres.online, Feb. 13, 2024, <u>https://progres.online/society/the-state-directed-internet-blockade-continued-in-turkmenistan-in-2023/</u>.

- 7. International organizations have shared their concerns and recommendations in relation to Internet access in Turkmenistan. During the official visit to Turkmenistan, in June 2023, OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media, Teresa Ribeiro, pointed out restrictions on the free flow of and limited access to information, both online and offline. She noted that "in today's interdependent world, freedom of the media is only achievable by ensuring equal access to the online information ecosystem" and that "full and unrestricted access to the internet forms a crucial part of media pluralism in the country." She urged the Turkmen authorities to uphold the commitments of the OSCE regarding freedom of expression and media freedom.
- 8. <u>The UNDP</u> has mapped Turkmenistan's digital ecosystem and pointed out piecemeal efforts that lack systemic approach and synergies between digital initiatives. They identified major challenges such as low digital literacy, fragmented e-government services, and insufficient digital infrastructure, especially in rural areas. The UNDP Country Team emphasized that "true transformation requires systemic change, not just technological adoption."

Internet Shutdowns and Blockings: Impact on Rights and Development

- 9. The state directed Internet blockade and aggressive censorship: Turkmenistan has a long history of internet shutdowns. Any platform or website that publishes critical views on government policies or officials faces an immediate ban. All major social media platforms such as Facebook, X, Instagram, YouTube or LinkedIn are blocked in Turkmenistan. The authorities also shut down Wikipedia in 2019 because of an article that contained unflattering remarks about former president Gurbanguly Berdimuhamedov. In March 2021, authorities blocked Zoom video conferencing service and PayPal payment system.
- 10. There is no open register of websites that have been blocked. Most of the restrictions are arbitrary, not subject to independent judicial review, and are imposed without warnings and explanations to site owners. According to <u>Measuring and Evading Turkmenistan's</u> <u>Internet Censorship research</u>, the Turkmen government is using firewalls and interference techniques to block over 122,000 domains. As blocking is not applied to all IP addresses equally, millions of domains are very likely over-blocked due to inaccurate regular-expression rules.⁴ Overblocking results in Turkmen IT specialists being unable to reach the

⁴ Progres Foundation, *The Scale of Internet Censorship in Turkmenistan: 122,000 Domains are Blocked*, Progres.online, May. 5, 2023, <u>https://progres.online/society/the-scale-of-internet-censorship-in-turkmenistan-122000-domains-are-blocked/</u>

<u>development platform GitHub</u>, even in the absence of any political rationale for blocking it.

- 11. Access Now, the #KeepItOn coalition a coalition of more than 300 organizations from 105 countries around the world dedicated to fighting internet shutdowns and other organizations have also investigated and documented internet shutdowns in Turkmenistan.
- 12. In March 2022, a one-hour internet outage <u>was reported</u> in Ashgabat, Turkmenistan's capital, that coincided with preparations for the inauguration of President <u>Serdar Berdimuhamedov</u>. In an attempt to <u>eliminate circumvention tools</u> such as virtual private networks (VPNs) authorities <u>have blocked</u> several hosting providers.
- 13. In April, 2022, Cloudflare Radar <u>registered a significant drop</u> in internet traffic in Turkmenistan. In June, 2023, the internet traffic in Turkmenistan <u>again dropped to almost</u> <u>zero</u> around the opening of Arkadag city, dedicated to the former president Gurbanguly Berdimuhamedov.
- 14. The slow speed of the Internet: The government deliberately keeps the Internet speed slow and unreliable in comparison with neighboring countries and global standards. According to <u>Cable.co.uk</u>, Turkmenistan ranks 206th out of 220 economies, making it to the top-5 countries with the slowest internet connection. According to <u>the Speedtest Global</u> <u>Index</u> the average Internet speed in Turkmenistan as of October 2024 was 3.44 Mbps. Given that most modern websites are designed for a larger flow of information and contain heavy elements such as photos and videos, limited broadband speed results in inaccessibility of most websites in Turkmenistan.
- 15. Internet shutdowns interfere with a range of human rights, not only the right to freedom of opinion and expression, access to information, and freedom of assembly, but also economic, social, and cultural rights. The international community is committed to opposing internet shutdowns, and provides evidence that shutdowns are a violation of international human rights law. As early as 2011, international human rights experts issued a joint declaration stating that cutting off access to the internet "can never be justified, including on public order or national security grounds."⁵
- 16. **Internet censorship undermines the right to health (art. 12)**: According to <u>Saglyk.org</u>, doctors in Turkmenistan cannot access modern treatment protocols, read the latest medical researches, learn about best novel practices in healthcare or stay up to date with global

⁵ OSCE, *International Mechanisms for Promoting Freedom of Expression*, Joint Declaration on Freedom of Expression and the Internet, 2011, available online: <u>https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/e/9/78309.pdf</u>.

epidemics news. Likewise, patients do not have access to life saving medical information, especially during public health emergencies such as COVID-19 pandemic. As the U.N. Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of freedom of opinion and expression highlights in his <u>thematic report</u> on the impacts of COVID-19, access to the internet is "a critical element of health-care policy and practice, public information and even the right to life" (para 24), and the denial of such access interferes with the enjoyment of various fundamental rights (para 26).

- 17. According to <u>Azatlyk</u>,⁶ State sector employees, including medical workers, are forced to have their mobile phones regularly checked. Furthemore, they have to provide a written consent that they will delete social media accounts. Those who use virtual private networks (VPN) to access restricted websites risk being fired.
- 18. Blocking access to the Internet impedes the right to education (art. 13): Access to the Internet is crucial for quality education as it helps both students and teachers to engage in self-directed learning, use the latest developments in the education field, access diversity of information, collaborate online with each other and with learners across the world. The COVID-19 pandemic emphasized the importance of digital connectivity. However, with only <u>37.2% of secondary schools</u> in Turkmenistan having access to the Internet, many young people are robbed of the possibility to learn online. Youth in Turkmenistan have limited educational and employment prospects. Only <u>3 out of 10</u> secondary school graduates are able to complete tertiary education while <u>21.8% of youth</u> are not in employment, education or training. If these young individuals had unrestricted access to the Internet, they could develop skills and expertise using the advantages of educational videos on YouTube, accessing the freely available online courses from the world's leading universities and finding employment opportunities including remote jobs.
- 19. Internet shutdowns prevent State-parties from fulfilling their obligations to respect, protect and fulfill each of the "essential features" (availability, accessibility, acceptability, adaptability) of the right to education.
- 20. Accessibility of education, as defined by CESCR, should encompass the interrelated dimensions of (a) non-discrimination and (b) physical accessibility,⁷ meaning that

⁶ Azatlyk (Turkmen Service of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty), *Public sector officials are asked to close IMO and other social media accounts* [Býujet işgärlerinden IMO we beýleki sosial media hesaplarını ýapmak talep edilýär], Apr. 26, 2024, <u>https://www.azathabar.com/a/byujet-isgarlerinden-imo-we-beyleki-sosial-media-hasaplaryny-yapmak-talap-edilyar/32866509.html</u>

⁷ CESCR, *General comment N 13*, para. 6 (b), E/C.12/1999/10 [1999], available at: https://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=4slQ6QSmlBEDzFEovLCuW%2BKyH%2BnXpras yMzd2e8mx4cYlD1VMUKXaG3Jw9bomilLKS84HB8c9nIHQ9mUemvt0Fbz%2F0SS7kENyDv5%2FbYPWAxM w47K5jTga59puHtt3NZr.

education must be accessible to all, especially the most vulnerable groups, in law and fact, and has to be within safe physical reach, either by attendance at some reasonably convenient geographic location <...> or via modern technology <...>.⁸ Thus, internet shutdowns undermine principles of non-discrimination and physical accessibility of education.

- 21. Academic freedom, which includes "the liberty of individuals to express freely opinions about the institution or system in which they work and to fulfill their functions without discrimination or fear of repression by the State or any other actor",⁹ is also undermined by internet shutdowns and other internet restrictions. While Turkmen government has the duty to respect academic freedom of students¹⁰, it also forces them to sign declarations pledging to access only allowed websites and to use the internet for "educational purposes" only.¹¹ Such demands are unacceptable, especially coming from the government that regularly restricts legitimate speech.¹²
- 22. Restricted access to the Internet hinders the right to culture and to benefit from scientific progress (art.15): As defined by CESCR, the obligation to respect the right to benefit from scientific progress and its applications requires States parties to "eliminate censorship or arbitrary limitations on access to the Internet, which undermines access to and dissemination of scientific knowledge".¹³ Contrary to this duty, authorities in Turkmenistan not only block social media platforms and video conferencing services that are crucial for exchanging ideas, but prevent national IT specialists from reaching the development platform GitHub, endangering scientific development in the country.¹⁴

¹³ CESCR, *General comment N 25*, para 42, E/C.12/GC/25 [2020], available at:

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ CESCR, *General comment N 13*, para. 39, E/C.12/1999/10 [1999], available at:

 $[\]label{eq:https://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=4slQ6QSmlBEDzFEovLCuW%2BKyH%2BnXprasyMzd2e8mx4cYlD1VMUKXaG3Jw9bomilLKS84HB8c9nIHQ9mUemvt0Fbz%2F0SS7kENyDv5%2FbYPWAxMw47K5jTga59puHtt3NZr.$

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ RadioFreeEurope/RadioLiberty, *Turkmenistan Increases Crackdown On Internet Access As Living Standards Continue Downward Spiral*, 19 Sep. 2020, available at: <u>https://www.rferl.org/a/turkmenistan-increases-crackdown-on-internet-access-as-living-standards-continue-downward-spiral/30846977.html</u>.

¹² United States Department of State. *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2023: Turkmenistan.* 22 Apr. 2024. <u>https://www.state.gov/reports/2023-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/turkmenistan/</u>.

 $[\]label{eq:https://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=4slQ6QSmlBEDzFEovLCuW1a0Szab0oXTdImnsJZ ZVQdxONLLLJiul8wRmVtR5Kxx73i0Uz0k13FeZiqChAWHKFuBqp%2B4RaxfUzqSAfyZYAR%2Fq7sqC7AHR a48PPRALHB.$

¹⁴ Access Now, What Turkmenistan internet shutdowns tell us about digital repression in Central Asia, Dec. 7,

^{2021,} available at: <u>https://www.accessnow.org/turkmenistan-internet-shutdowns/</u>.; Chronicles of Turkmenistan, Интернет в Туркменистане: устаревшие технологии, произвольная цензура и бутафорские разработки, Feb. 16, 2021, available at: <u>https://www.hronikatm.com/2021/02/internet-tm/</u>.; TurkmenNews, *B Туркменистане* активизировали блокировку VPN, заблокирован Zoom и PayPal, Mar. 15, 2021, available at:

<https://turkmen.news/v-turkmenistane-aktivizirovali-blokirovku-vpn-zablokirovan-zoom-i-paypal/.

- 23. Lack of open access to the Internet also impedes academic research. In 2019 there were only 2 scientific publications in Turkmenistan per million inhabitants compared to 202 in Kazakhstan. Access to the Internet would foster research and innovation in the country, empower Turkmen citizens to create and share content in Turkmen language, making it part of the world heritage. Turkmenistan's progress in achieving SDG 9 on industry, innovation and infrastructure has been stagnant or increasing at less than 50% of required rate. Turkmenistan's spending on research and development was merely 0.13% of GDP in 2021 while the average in upper middle income countries was 1.56%.
- 24. The lack of internet impacts people's ability to enjoy economic rights: The Internet is essential to practice the right to work and a decent standard of living. Everywhere in the world the Internet has become an indispensable part of career and business development. Jobs are increasingly advertised online and people are expected to submit their job applications through relevant websites. The internet allows users to manage their finances and grow their businesses. However, with limited access to the Internet entrepreneurs in Turkmenistan are unable to advertise their products and services online, while online shopping and payment services are very limited.
- 25. Internet shutdowns and restrictions have a significant economic toll in Turkmenistan. Over six months of 2022, Turkmenistan lost \$29 million from deliberate internet shutdowns, according to <u>Top10VPN</u>. Using the Global Network Initiative's methodology, the economic cost of partial Internet shutdowns amounts to approximately <u>\$327 million annually</u>. The Netloss Calculator Estimates a year of partial internet shutdowns would increase unemployment in Turkmenistan <u>by 420 people</u>.

Internet Access and Censorship: Challenges and Barriers

- 26. Limited number of Internet users: According to the state media reports, after spending \$273 million on projects to expand telecommunication networks, Turkmenistan has achieved 100% coverage of populated areas with high-speed Internet. Meanwhile, official statistics refers to 3,149,178 Internet users in Turkmenistan, which is roughly 44.6% of the total population. According to Dataportal internet penetration at the start of 2024 was 39.5% with 2.59 million internet users, which leaves 60.5% of the population offline. As of January 2024, there were only 111.8 thousand social media users in Turkmenistan, equating to 1.7% of the population.
- 27. The high cost of the Internet: The services of the monopoly internet service provider, Turkmentelecom (which provides internet access, mobile communications and email services), remain expensive in Turkmenistan. Turkmenistan stands 7th for most

expensive <u>mobile data</u> in the world (\$11.42) and the most expensive <u>broadband</u> <u>Internet</u> (\$45.80) in the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) region. Turkmen Internet users with a minimum salary wage spend anywhere from 20% to 76% of their monthly income on the Internet.

- 28. The lack of enforcement: The law "On legal regulation of the Internet development and Internet services in Turkmenistan," adopted in 2014, states that the government must take measures to ensure universal and equal access to the Internet, particularly to socially vulnerable groups; and to develop Internet infrastructure in rural, remote, and hard-to-reach areas. The state also takes measures to prevent unjustified restrictions on the activities and information exchange of the Internet providers, supports the development of the Internet infrastructure of State and non-State actors and prevents monopolization and unfair Turkmenistan competition (Art. 8). Nevertheless, has the least 7, developed telecommunications sector in Central Asia. The International Telecommunication Union's ICT Regulatory Tracker puts Turkmenistan as a 'regulated public monopoly' with a command-and-control approach to ICT. Turkmenistan scored 6.70 out of 100 among 193 countries in 2022.
- 29. Limited access to diverse sources of information: According to the <u>Vibrant Information</u> <u>Barometer</u> (VIBE) 2023: people in Turkmenistan do not have access to diverse sources of information due to ongoing aggressive state directed censorship of electronic communication and blocking of Internet sites thereby making the Internet unavailable to the population. As the <u>report cites</u>, "people do not have the rights, means, or capacity to access a wide range of information; they do not recognize or reject misinformation; and they cannot or do not make choices on what types of information they want to engage with." VIBE ranked Turkmenistan's information ecosystem as 'not vibrant' scoring 1 out of 40, where the higher number indicates a highly vibrant information environment. Turkmenistan's overall country score dropped two points, from 3 in 2022 to 1 in 2023. It also ranked the worst out of 18 countries.¹⁵
- 30. The law "<u>On legal regulation of the Internet development and Internet services in</u> <u>Turkmenistan</u> does not specify the role and mandate of the two institutions - the Cyber Security Service, under the Ministry of Communications, which executes the illegal orders to block the Internet, and the Cybersecurity Directorate under the Ministry of Homeland Security, which is the main perpetrator of Internet blocking. None of these institutions have a website and there is no publicly available information about their structure, functional mandate, authority, competencies or annual reports about their activities such as on

¹⁵ IREX, *Vibrant Information Barometer (VIBE)*, (Washington DC, United States: IREX Publications, 2024), available at: <u>https://www.irex.org/resource/vibrant-information-barometer-vibe</u>.

cybersecurity incidents. This raises serious concerns about its public accountability and adherence of its practices to international human rights standards.

- 31. The use of censorship circumvention tools remains illegal: According to the Progres Foundation <u>article</u> there is a large-scale government led censorship and control of the internet which forces the citizens of Turkmenistan to use censorship circumvention tools risking financial and legal punishments. Accessing almost all websites in Turkmenistan requires a VPN, which increases the demand and price for such services.
- 32. Given the demand for circumvention tools such as VPNs and <u>TOR bridges</u>, the government constantly blocks these platforms and persecutes installers and users of these tools. For instance, Turkmenistan residents are asked to <u>swear on the Quran</u> not to use the circumvention tools while signing up for a home internet connection.
- 33. In January 2023, the security officials in Balkan province raided the homes of VPN installers, detaining and fining 10 individuals. Later, on October 3, in Ashgabat, a technical expert was arrested for 15 days and fined 15,000 manat (about US\$4,285) for installing VPN services. While VPNs are not outlawed in Turkmenistan the use of "uncertified" encryption programs is a criminal offense with a risk to face up to seven years of imprisonment.

The Isolated Turkmen Internet: National Network and Local Platforms

- 34. Creating National Digital Network disconnected to the global Internet: As of November 2024, there is no publicly available information on the progress made toward building the National Digital Network not connected to the Internet, which was proposed by the country's Minister of Foreign Affairs, Rashid Meredov, in 2022. So far the only country that has such a network is North Korea (e.g. Koryolink). While the government of Turkmenistan does not share any detailed plans with the public, the announced intention to create such a network demonstrates the government's unwillingness to relinquish its stranglehold on information.
- 35. **Suggested questions:** Other UN treaty bodies have repeatedly called on the State party to ensure the public's access to the Internet. We urge the Committee to follow up on these recommendations and to pose the following questions to the State party:
 - Increase the transparency of the work of the Cybersecurity Directorate and provide information about its structure, functional mandate, authority, and competencies, including the appeal procedure of its decisions.

- Provide information on the number of blocked websites and the list of criteria for such blockings.
- Guarantee users' right to appeal and effective remedy. Provide the transparent and accessible appeal mechanisms of Government-issued website blockings, where the reason for the removal or blocking is clearly stated and any order contains a precise explanation of what rights the content provider has and the possibilities to appeal the decision or opt for judicial review. Guarantee that the option of judicial redress is granted by law.
- Provide information about the existing safeguards that exclude any non-transparent and possibly arbitrary decisions and limit websites' blockings to illegal content and have no arbitrary or excessive effects?
- What is the legal framework for the development of the National Digital Network?
- End the practice of arbitrarily punishing citizens for using circumvention tools and accessing information online. Repeal or otherwise amend laws which impose responsibility for using VPNs or accessing blocked content online.
- Adhere to international human rights standards, and uphold its commitments to promote and protect the right to education, employment, and cultural participation offline and online. Refrain from shutting down the internet and blocking social media and make a state pledge to refrain from imposing any unlawful restrictions on internet access and telecommunication in the future. What will the State party do to ensure open and unrestricted internet access, especially in rural areas, schools and hospitals, and to enhance digital literacy and to invest in the country's technological infrastructure to bridge the digital divide?
- Open the National Plan for development of the digital economy to public scrutiny and increase transparency of its implementation